John Gardner's Feedback 5-8-11

This is another masterful job of "analytics". We have had 197 institutions undergo the FoE process but I have never seen one of them do what you have done here—i.e. lay out very coherently and succinctly the proposed activities connected to both the nine Foundational Dimensions of Excellence and relevant supportive citations from the literature. Congratulations. This is another tool, outcome you have produced that is definitely worthy of sharing with other institutioins. I hope you will let us put this in our FoEtec Resource Center for the inspiration and edification of others. Another reaction that I have is how wonderful it would be if you now took the next step and combined this matrix with a schematic of who, what units, offices, should be tasked with implementing these steps, and according to what timeline and priority, and accountable to whom or what for doing so. Then you would have THE truly complete matrix and blueprint, masterfully and succinctly presented. I hope you will go on to this next step.
John Gardner
May 8, 2011

Bronx Community College Freshman Year Analytical Group
Chart of Proposed Activities with Corresponding Rationale/Theories of Action
May 5, 2011

Proposed Activities, Practices and Policies (and Rationale) for Addressing Problems and Goals[1]

I. Facilitate student success in (and progress through) basic skills requirements and first year courses

Proposed Activities	Rationale for Proposed Activities- Theories of Action
1. Improve incoming student skills scores with multiple opportunities for	▪ FoE Learning Dimension (foundations institutions deliver curricular

[1] The nine Foundational Dimensions utilized by the John Gardner Institute for Excellence in the Freshman Year are based on a thorough review of literature. A selected bibliography is attached from the Institute and references to the dimensions' characteristics in this table are therefore included in the "evidence" to support a proposed activity

success prior to 1st enrollment a. Provide multiple opportunities (in a variety of formats – web, print, workshops) for incoming students to learn about and prepare for the freshman placement tests (including new Accuplacer software). b. Provide intensive basic skills workshops (after first testing and before beginning of semester) for students prior to their first semester enrollment c. Clarify the purpose of assessment testing for students as it relates to placement	learning experiences that engage new students in order to develop knowledge, skills and behaviors consistent with …. academic goals) ▪ Using multiple assessment measures may improve placement accuracy and math performance (Hughes, K and Scott-Clayton, 2011; Marwick, 2004) ▪ The faster students make progress towards a degree, the more likely they are to complete a degree (Edgecombe, 2011; Bowen et al. 2009) ▪ Participation in pre-freshman skills workshops associated with 1st semester and subsequent college success (BCC, CUNY research)
2. Require students to take remedial courses (or complete a significant portion of remedial requirements) before taking credit bearing courses a. Restrict course selections for all students with outstanding remedial need. b. Students with 3 remedial needs must take remedial and freshman seminar before taking credit classes c. Modify prerequisites for difficult first level credit-bearing courses	▪ FoE Learning Dimension (foundations institutions deliver curricular learning experiences that engage new students in order to develop knowledge, skills and behaviors consistent with …. academic goals) ▪ BCC college-level credit bearing courses do not all require college-level skills in reading, writing and/or mathematics – and students who demonstrate college-level skills substantially outperform those who do not in credit courses (BCC research) ▪ Students who pass at least 1 remedial exit exam in first year have significantly higher likelihood of retention/graduation (BCC research) ▪ Students must have the capacity (knowledge and skills) to succeed in more advanced coursework (Jolley et al 2004)
3. Utilize strategies that have been demonstrated as effective in developmental courses, such as: contextualization of basic skills instruction; student collaboration; focus on problem representation; foster connections between reading and writing (and assess their effectiveness).	▪ Contextualization demonstrated to facilitate student learning in remedial/development coursework (Perin, 2011) ▪ Student collaboration and teaching math through application (real life problem solving) positively associated with math learning (Hodara, 2011) ▪ Improving problem representation skills impacts math learning (Hodara, 2011)
4. Provide academic and social supports – so that all students who need them are assured of effective exposure to them: a. Embed academic and social supports (faculty and peer tutors, mentors, coaches) within basic skills courses. b. Require (as a mandatory part of course grade) and track attendance for academic supports (such as tutoring, writing lab, etc) for students with particular risk profiles.	▪ FoE Organization Dimension (foundations institutions … student services units provide coherent experience for new students) ▪ Non-academic student supports improve persistence by: creating social relationships, clarifying aspirations and enhancing commitment, developing college know-how & making college life feasible (Karp, 2011) ▪ Effective institutions emphasize the importance of coordinating instruction and student supports (Jenkins, 2007; Kuh et al, 2005;

c. Identify appropriate and/or required alternative supports for students who are repeating remedial courses. d. Facilitate students forming connections with academic departments.	Muraskin & Lee, 2004) ▪ Social relations, integration and cultural capital associated with academic progress (Karp, 2008) ▪ Students who most need services don't seek them out. ▪ Effective academic advising/peer mentoring associated with academic success and progress (Karp, 2011;Bahr, 2008; Crisp, 2010; Scrivener, 2009, 2007)

II. Facilitate efficient and effective course taking (towards meeting graduation requirements)

1. Utilize assessment tools and counseling before 1st semester enrollment to determine appropriate major program, schedule modalities, and support services for students.	▪ FoE Organization Dimension (foundations institutions guide and align all aspects of the new student experience .. and provide a coherent experience) ▪ FoE All Students Dimension (foundations institutions serve all students according to their varied needs) ▪ Accelerating program entry and completion impacted by: marketing tools demonstrating major program streams; early exposure to college programs, options and requirements; clearly mapped out program requirements and prescribed courses (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ Freshman survey of goals, experiences and self-assessment found to be good predictor of academic performance and attrition (Pickering and Calliote, 1995) ▪ Assessment of student needs should lead directly to interventions designed to meet those needs.
2. Assist students (through assessment, counseling and advisement) in selecting a major and developing an individual academic plan during first semester enrollment	▪ FoE Organization Dimension (foundations institutions guide and align all aspects of the new student experience .. and provide a coherent experience) ▪ FoE All Students Dimension (foundations institutions serve all students according to their varied needs) ▪ Clarifying aspirations and enhancing commitment associated with improved community college student outcomes (Karp, 2011) ▪ Program entry and completion impacted by: clearly mapped out program requirements and prescribed courses (Jenkins, 2011)

	▪ Program completion impacted by consolidating program offerings into smaller number of program streams and clearly mapped out programs and sequences of courses (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ Community college students more likely to persist and succeed in programs that are tightly structured, with little room for deviation from successful pathways (Scott-Clayton, 2011)
3. Provide all first semester (and second semester) students with a recommended program of study relative to their curriculum choice and personal circumstances (ft/pt choice, days and times, etc). This will require identifying appropriate schedules for students in a variety of majors.	▪ Clarifying aspirations and enhancing commitment (Karp, 2011) associated with improved community college student outcomes ▪ Program entry and completion impacted by: clearly mapped out program requirements and prescribed courses (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ Program completion impacted by consolidating program offerings into smaller number of program streams and clearly mapped out programs and sequences of courses (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ Community college students more likely to persist and succeed in programs that are tightly structured, with little room for deviation from successful pathways (Scott-Clayton, 2011)
4. Evaluate appropriateness of course sequencing and prerequisites to maximize student success.	▪ Course pass rates are low and withdrawal rates are high at BCC. BCC college-level credit bearing courses do not all require college-level skills in reading, writing and/or mathematics and students who demonstrate college-level skills substantially outperform those who do not in credit courses (BCC research) ▪ Continuity (fully articulated system where the knowledge and skills necessary for successful movement to more advanced levels are provided earlier in appropriate sequence) impacts student academic success (Jolley, et al)
5. Require all students who are on academic warning and probation – to develop a corrective action plan that will assist them in attaining good academic standing (such as must take x courses and receive GPA of 2.5, etc)	▪ FoE All Students Dimension (foundations institutions serve all students according to their varied needs) ▪ Good advising negatively associated with attrition (Metzner, 1989) ▪ Students are more likely to persist and succeed in tightly structured programs with little room for deviation (Scott-Clayton, 2011)
6. Re-examine advisement processes for 1st year and continuing students	▪ FoE All Students Dimension (foundations institutions serve all students according to their varied needs) ▪ Good advising negatively associated with attrition (Metzner, 1989)

III. Promote Student Engagement and Knowledge of College Expectations

1. Simplify bureaucratic processes involving pre-enrollment and first enrollment activities.	▪ FoE Organization Dimension (foundations institutions provide a comprehensive, coordinated approach to the new student experience through effective organizational structures and policies). ▪ High performing institutions demonstrate functional alignment (manage the organization's core functions in a coordinated way) (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ High performing institutions focus on customer (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ Resilient organizations are characterized by well aligned incentives, decision rights, information and organization structure (Neilson, et al 2005).
2. Identify what (and when) students must know about pre-enrollment, registration, payment processes and simplify communications to students about them a. Develop on-line checklist of pre-enrollment requirements – so students can see what is expected and what is outstanding	▪ FoE Organization Dimension (foundations institutions provide a comprehensive, coordinated approach to the new student experience through effective organizational structures and policies. Theses guide and align all aspects of the new student experience). ▪ High performing institutions demonstrate functional alignment (manage the organization's core functions in a coordinated way) (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ High performing institutions focus on customer (Jenkins, 2011)
3. Provide orientation experiences and corresponding materials (written, web, etc) that will help students transition to college life and academic success	▪ FoE Roles and Purposes Dimension (Foundations institutions promote student understanding of the various roles and purposes of higher education and those unique to the two-year institutions…. Students are exposed to the value of both a general education and focused study in an academic or career field) ▪ FoE Transitions Dimension (Foundations institutions facilitate appropriate student transitions beginning with outreach … and continuing throughout the period of enrollment)
4. Engage campus community in identifying what student behaviors and activities promote student success and develop simple messages (print, web, etc.) to market these ideas (to both students and faculty)	▪ Foe Philosophy Dimension (Foundations institutions intentionally cultivate learning environments for new students that emerge from a philosophy of two-year colleges as gateways to higher education) ▪ FoE Transitions Dimension (Foundations Institution s are forthright about their responsibilities to students as well as students' responsibilities to themselves and the institution).

5. Encourage student academic and social interaction a. Encourage use of study groups b. Assign group work projects (including within a group stronger and weaker students) c. Encourage student participation in extra and co-curricular activities	▪ FoE Campus Culture Dimension (Foundations institutions make new students a high priority …a culture of responsibility for the experiences of new students characterizes these institutions. This culture is realized through high quality instruction, services and support as well as substantial interactions with students, both inside and outside the classroom. ▪ Minority students particularly benefit from social relationships (Bensimon, 2007) ▪ Positive informal relationships with external agents encourage student success (Rendon, 1994) ▪ Student engagement associated with student success (Jolly et al, Astin, Pascarella & Terenzini., Tinto)
6. Promote career connections and real-life experiences for students, including: a. Work study with outside companies and organizations b. Internships for credit c. Guest speakers and career fairs	▪ FoE Roles and Purposes Dimension (Foundations institutions promote roles and purposes of higher education …. These roles and purposes include learning for personal growth, career enhancement, workplace preparation and retraining, transfer…engaged citizenship, and serving the public good. ▪ Foe Diversity Dimension (Foundations institutions ensure that new students experience ongoing exploration of diverse ideas, world view and cultures as a means of enhancing their learning and participation in pluralistic communities.

IV. Promote Faculty Use of Engaged and Effective Pedagogies

1. Support faculty development efforts, including: faculty assessment of effective classroom techniques; bests practices workshops; faculty mentor programs; faculty study groups; scholarship of teaching	▪ FoE Learning Dimension (Foundations Institutions deliver curricular and co-curricular learning experiences that engage new students in order to develop knowledge, skills, attitudes and behaviors consistent with the institutional mission, students' academic and career goals and workplace expectations. ▪ FoE Campus Culture Dimension (Foundation Institutions make new students a high priority for faculty and staff. A culture of responsibility for the experiences of new students characterizes these institutions.

	▪ Foe Organization Dimension (Foundations institutions … provide a coherent experience for new students that is enhanced by ongoing faculty and staff development activities and appropriate budgetary arrangements. ▪ Effective teaching practice emphasizes: contact between students and faculty; reciprocity and cooperation among students; uses active learning techniques; prompt feedback; time on task; communicating high expectations; respect for diverse talents and learning styles (Chickering and Ehrmann, 1996) ▪ Effective organizations encourage employee involvement and professional development (Jenkins, 2011)
2. Provide college incentives for professional development	▪ Incentive systems communicate what matters most to senior management (Neilson, et al, 2005). ▪ Offering formal and informal incentives improves teaching and learning (Walker, et al 2008)
3. Seriously consider (and clearly articulate the role of) excellence in teaching in promotion and tenure decisions a. Clearly articulate the role of excellent teaching in decision making b. Revise student evaluation to include dimensions of engaged and effective teaching practice	▪ FoE Campus Culture Dimension (Foundation Institutions make new students a high priority for faculty and staff. A culture of responsibility for the experiences of new students characterizes these institutions). ▪ Incentive systems communicate what matters most to senior management (Neilson, et al, 2005) ▪ Offering formal and informal incentives improves teaching and learning (Walker, et al 2008)
4. Encourage experimentation and assessment of teaching innovation.	▪ Research is more likely to inform teaching practice, when conducted collaboratively with faculty (Morest and Jenkins, 2007) ▪ Improving underprepared community college student outcomes results from research focused on teaching and learning (Bond, 2009) ▪ Offering formal and informal incentives improves teaching and learning (Walker, et al 2008)

V. Provide for a cohesive first year experience with clear pathways, organized experiences, consistent communications with clear oversight and accountabilities in place

1. Redesign freshman seminar course to strengthen student disposition, promote student engagement and prepare students for successful collegiate academic behaviors. The new course will: a. be co-taught by faculty, counselors and peer mentors b. incorporate use of e-portfolios (as an academic and advisement tool) c. expand number of instructional and support hours	▪ FoE Learning Dimension (Foundations Institutions deliver curricular and co-curricular learning experiences that engage new students in order to develop knowledge, skills, attitudes and behaviors consistent with the institutional missions, students' academic and career goals and workplace expectations. ▪ participation in student success course correlated with improved retention (Boudreau, 1994) ▪ students in student success course increase course maturity, have greater knowledge of campus resources and use resources more often (Keenan, 1995) ▪ e-portfolio use associated with effective advisement practices and effective learning (Chen and Black, 2010; Chen and Light, 2009; Eynon, 2009) ▪ requiring community college students to take a 3-credit college success course (exposing students to college programs, facilitating their completion of an educational plan, and providing instruction in college success skills) accelerates their progress through their degrees (Jenkins, 2011) ▪ there is a direct correlation between the teaching of study skills preparation to first year students and their academic achievement and persistence (Jansen, 2010)
2. Develop and require clearly articulated academic and support pathways for students that are designed to enhance student success	▪ Community college students are more likely to persist and succeed in programs that are tightly and consciously structured, with little room for individuals to deviate from paths to completion. (Scott-Clayton, 2011)
3. Establish a single, clearly articulated administrative structure to oversee the freshman-year program, including orientation, workshops, advisement materials and activities, course offerings, and supports. (This will include all grant funded initiatives as well). a. Clearly articulate and differentiate roles, responsibilities and functions	▪ FoE Organization Dimension (Foundations institutions provide a comprehensive, coordinated and flexible approach to the new student experience through effective organizations structures and policies). ▪ Effective organizations have clearly articulated and well differentiated roles and responsibilities (Neilson et al, 2005)
4. Incorporate meaningful assessment into all freshman year efforts in order	▪ FoE Improvement Dimension (Foundations Institutions conduct

to inspire and promote ongoing improvement through evidence-based decision-making and change	assessment and maintain associations with professional organizations in order to effect improvement. Assessment provides feedback to new students to guide their learning, to faculty to guide their teaching, and to the institution to guide planning, resource allocation, decision making and improvement of policies and procedures. ▪ Research is more likely to inform teaching practice, when conducted collaboratively with faculty (Morest and Jenkins, 2007) ▪ Improving underprepared community college student outcomes results from research focused on teaching and learning (Bond, 2009) ▪ High performing organizations engage in the use of measurement and process improvement (Jenkins, 2011)
5. Utilize electronic tools to support faculty, student and administrative efficiency and effectiveness a. Systematize processes for assessing student needs and satisfaction; reporting results; developing & improving programs and processes; and evaluating results.	▪ Electronic tools facilitate knowledge management (a best business practice) which is associated with effectiveness and efficiency and involves providing actionable information to individuals who are empowered to act accordingly (Bernbom, 2000). ▪ Electronic tools provide the *Business Intelligence* to enable the transforming, aggregating and analyzing of raw data into meaningful, actionable data that can inform effective practice. (Quinn, 2003). ▪ Electronic tools provide for scalable (and therefore) effective efforts – by embedding analytics in business processes.